

IBSEC-CSS-M-19

9 February 1970

COMPUTER SECURITY SUBCOMMITTEE  
OF THE  
UNITED STATES INTELLIGENCE BOARD  
SECURITY COMMITTEE

Minutes of Meeting  
Held at CIA Headquarters  
Langley, Virginia  
9 February 1970

1. The nineteenth meeting of the Computer Security Subcommittee was held on 9 February 1970 between 0930 and 1200 hours in Room 4E-64, CIA Headquarters. In attendance were:

[Redacted]

STAT

Mr. Alexander S. Chodakowski, State Alternate

[Redacted]

STAT

Mr. Thomas A. Eccleston, Army Member

Mr. Robert B. Cameron, Navy Member

Lt. Col. Charles V. Burns, Air Force Member

[Redacted]

STAT

Mr. Raymond J. Brady, AEC Member

Mr. Donald R. Roderick, FBI Member

[Redacted]

STAT

Mr. William S. Donaldson, Air Force

Mr. Phillip W. Lowell, FBI

[Redacted]

STAT

2. The security level of the meeting was announced as Top Secret COMINT.

Group 1<sup>c</sup>

Excluded from automatic  
downgrading and  
declassification

~~SECRET~~



3. Hardware Security Evaluation Briefing: [ ]  
[ ] of the Research and Development component of CIA at the instant meeting provided members with a briefing on the results of a recent CIA contract entailing the evaluation of a portion of the hardware of an IBM 360/50 computer system. The purpose of the contract was to evaluate the security effectiveness of the certain portions of the systems hard wired logic. The results of the study reflected approximately 100 specific cases where a single hardware failure could compromise system security without that failure being detected. Of significance was the effort required to complete this limited study and evaluation in terms of cost and time. It was also noted that the information required for the study was not readily available. In addition the results were applicable only to a specific configuration of a Model 50. Transferability of the analytical results to a different system would not be possible.

STAT  
STAT

4. At the conclusion of the briefing, [ ] fielded several questions about different aspects of the contract and the report thereon. The Chairman expressed his appreciation for an extremely lucid description of the project and drew member attention to the fact that the Community and the Subcommittee needs to address the problem of system security evaluation, including the hardware aspects.

STAT

5. [ ] agreed to the distribution of the contract report to members. Dissemination will be accomplished at the next Subcommittee meeting. Although the contents of this report are considered unclassified, the Chairman requested that members treat it with extreme care and in no case to disseminate it to contractor personnel.

STAT

6. Approval of Minutes: The minutes of the 27 January 1970 meeting were approved without amendment.

7. Training Course Task Team Status Report: Mr. Cameron indicated that the Training Course Task Team had held a meeting since the previous Subcommittee meeting; progress is being made in developing a course outline, but he had nothing specific to report on this progress. Mr. Cameron also indicated that the guidance provided the Task Team at the 27 January Subcommittee meeting was sufficient for the time being.



8. Computer Security Threat Analysis: The Chairman advised that he had requested the Counterintelligence Staff of CIA to make a study of any known cases relating to the exploitation of the vulnerabilities of American computer operations by hostile services or components. The CI Staff study was due for completion by 13 February, in order to permit the Chairman to make an appropriate report to the Security Committee on 17 February. In addition, the Chairman tasked all Subcommittee members to report on their individual efforts in this regard by 13 February. At the instant meeting the FBI member orally reported that his investigation of the matter had developed several examples of misusing computer operations for criminal purposes. Those agencies with positive submissions would provide written reports; negative replies would be accepted telephonically by the Chairman.

9. With reference to the question of the postulated threat discussed at the previous meeting, the Chairman requested and received Subcommittee approval to report to the Security Committee that any study of this problem at this date was considered superfluous in view of the fact that the threat is already well recognized in both the security and ADP environments.

10. Security Labeling Standards: The Chairman reminded members that their submissions concerning the security labeling standard project were due on or before 24 February. He asked whether any members were having difficulty collating the required information; the NSA member indicated that some difficulty was being encountered with reference to the caveats used for sensitive SIGINT. Discussion of this problem was deferred and handled separately at the conclusion of the instant meeting.

11. Degaussing Study: The Chairman requested that the members of the Task Team assigned to the degaussing study effort attempt to meet prior to the next Computer Security Subcommittee meeting for the purpose of initiating a draft of the study.

12. Security Requirements for Multilevel Operations: The Chairman requested member comment on the concepts proposed at the previous meeting as potential fundamental requirements that might permit the operation of a computer system in a multilevel environment. He noted that the technology is advancing rapidly to a point



where multilevel operations needed accreditation, in order to utilize fully the capabilities of modern systems. The Chairman suggested that the Subcommittee consider preparation of a paper proposing minimum standards for multilevel operations in the benign environment identified earlier.

13. Discussion of this topic at the instant meeting was very limited; however, it is anticipated that the ideas mentioned at the earlier meeting will be under continuing review in the future.

14. The DIA member preferred to defer his comments on this issue in view of the DIA request to the Intelligence Information Handling Committee for sponsorship of a security test and evaluation of ANSRS. It was suggested, in view of the fact that the briefing given the Subcommittee on ANSRS took place over a year ago, that an update on ANSRS progress would be beneficial to all members. The Chairman cautioned, however, that such an update briefing, accenting the security features of the system, should not be scheduled with reference to the DIA proposal to the IHC, since the Security Committee has not yet been formally involved in this proposal. The DIA member agreed to arrange such a briefing, which was later scheduled for the 24 February meeting.

15. The Chairman suggested to the AEC member that a briefing by AEC personnel on security features in its systems might also be of benefit to the Subcommittee; he specifically referenced an earlier briefing on the AEC Secure Automatic Data Information Exchange (SADIE) system which was given at the NSA -- sponsored NOC 68. [ ] indicated he would look into the possibility of arranging such a briefing at a future meeting.

STAT

16. The next Subcommittee meeting was scheduled for 1330 hours on 24 February 1970.

STAT

[ ]  
Chairman  
Computer Security Subcommittee